



## HERITAGE COUNCIL OF NSW

### MEETING MINUTES – Approvals Committee

Tuesday, 4 March 2025 | 9:00 AM – 12:30 PM

*via teleconference*

#### ATTENDANCE

##### Members

Dr Nicholas Brunton	A/Chair
Dr Caitlin Allen	Member
Mr David Burdon	Member
Ms Alan Croker	Member
Ms Julie Marler	Member
Mr Bruce Pettman	Member
Ms Sally Barnes	Heritage Council Chair / Alternate Member

##### Apologies

Mr David McNamara	Member
Dr Danièle Hromek	Member

##### External Presenters

Ms Coralie McPhie	Landscape Architect, Lake Macquarie City Council (item 2.1)
Mr Callum Rowley	Building Designer, Lake Macquarie City Council (item 2.1)
Mr Tim Adams	Principal Archaeologist, Umwelt (item 2.1)
Mr Daniel Tower	Owner (item 2.2)
Mr Awkar Ruel	Architect, Rule Studios (item 2.2)
Mr Peter Lonergan	Architect, Director of Design, Cracknell & Lonergan Architects (item 2.2)

##### External Observers

Ms Rachel Robson	Community Land Planner, Lake Macquarie City Council (item 2.1)
Mr Daniel Walters	Team Leader Landscape Design, Lake Macquarie City Council (item 2.1)
Ms Skye Hengpoonthana	Architect, Cracknell & Lonergan Architects (item 2.2)

##### Heritage NSW

Ms Elizabeth Owers	Executive Director
Ms Kym McNamara	A/Director Heritage Assessments
Ms Rochelle Johnston	Strategic Manager Heritage Referrals
Ms Tempe Beaven	Senior Assessments Officer (items 2.1 & 2.2)
Mr Spiros Spyrou	Senior Assessments Officer (item 2.1)
Ms Shikha Jhaldiyal	Senior Assessments Officer (item 2.2)
Mr James Quoye	Senior Assessments Officer (item 2.2)
Ms Katrina Stankowski	Manager Assessments (item 2.3)
Ms Elizabeth Thomas	Senior Secretariat Officer

## 1. Welcome and formalities

The A/Chair, Nicholas Brunton, opened the meeting at 9:00 AM.

The A/Chair delivered an Acknowledgement of Country and welcomed attendees.

The A/Chair noted the apologies for this meeting, and it was confirmed that a quorum had been met.

### 1.1 Conflict of Interest Declarations

Nil.

### 1.2 Out of Session decisions

Nil

### 1.3 Minutes from Previous Meeting – 4 February 2025

The committee requested minor changes to the minutes of the previous meeting including an amendment to Resolution 2025-04 for *Item 2.2 National House (SHR 00581) and Hardware House (SHR 00580), 73 and 75 York Street, Sydney* as setout below.

Resolution 2025-04 (amended)
<p>The Heritage Council Approvals Committee:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>Notes the information provided by Heritage NSW in the preliminary assessment report.</li><li>Thanks Merivale (applicant) and their project team for their presentation.</li><li>Notes the likely impacts of the concept plan and the proposed impacts of the stage 1 works to National House and Hardware House (SHR 00581 and 00580).</li><li>Provides the following comments:<ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>Regarding the proposed likely impacts of the concept plan, while adaptive reuse of the buildings is supported, the demolition of 73 York Street and associated openings between buildings are not likely to be recommended for approval in their current form.</li><li>Further information is required from the proponent including the following:<ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>Demolition plan</li><li>Details and dimensions of proposed openings between buildings including location of existing piers or any other original structural detail</li><li>Detailed assessment of heritage significance based on the current criteria</li><li>A statement of heritage impact</li><li>An analysis of fabric and grading of significance</li><li>Visual analysis identifying significant views to and from the items including analysis of impact of proposed roof terrace at 75 York Street</li><li>A schedule of conservation works including to the building façade</li><li>Archaeological assessment</li><li>Services installation plans.</li></ol></li><li>In relation to the proposed physical works to be determined under this application, the following is noted:<ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>The proposed demolition of non-original fire stairs in 73 York Street is broadly supported, subject to further information</li><li>Further details on the significance of the 75 York Street fire stairs proposed for demolition are to be provided.</li><li>Further details on the significance of the fire stairs in the central void at the rear of 73 York Street proposed for demolition are to be provided.</li><li>Further details on activation of the ground floor plane and opportunities to reinstate original details.</li></ol></li></ol></li></ol>

<p>5. Agrees that this application will return to the Approvals Committee once the requested information is received and in accordance with the AC resolution.</p> <p>6. Agrees that a site visit should be undertaken.</p>
Moved by Vanessa Holtham and seconded by Bruce Pettman
<i>Amendments to this resolution were made at the AC 4Mar25 meeting and moved by Bruce Pettman and seconded by David Burdon</i>
<b>Resolution 2025-06</b>
<p>The Heritage Council Approvals Committee:</p> <p>1. <b>Confirms</b> the minutes of the previous ordinary meeting (Tuesday, 4 February 2025), as a complete and accurate record of that meeting, as amended.</p>
Moved by Bruce Pettman and seconded by Caitlin Allen

## 1.4 Matters Arising

The Committee noted that on 20 February 2025, the Heritage Council appointed Alan Croker to the Approvals Committee and retired Vanessa Holtham from the Approvals Committee and appointed her to the State Heritage Register Committee, effective immediately.

## 1.5 Action Report

The Committee noted the action report and items recommended for closure.

## 2. Matters for Consideration

### 2.1 Catherine Hill Bay Cultural Precinct (SHR 01828) IDA – pre lodgement consultation – community hub at Middle Camp – stage 1 of masterplan implementation

The Approvals Committee received a report from Heritage NSW and a presentation from Lake Macquarie City Council on the design development for *Stage 1 (Community Hub)* located at Middle Camp, part of the *Catherine Hill Bay Master Plan*. The design includes a community hall, playground, parking, village green, viewing platform and walkway from the hub to the existing oval.

#### *Key points of the presentation*

- The project is currently in the concept design phase.
- A bowling club was previously located on the site proposed for the Community Hub.
- Archaeological assessments have been completed. This site sits outside the archaeologically sensitive foredunes area and it is considered unlikely to have any Aboriginal artefacts or significant historical archaeological finds on the site.
- The Community Hub needs to integrate with the significant natural landscape while also meeting community needs and specific design concerns include minimising environmental impact, ensuring cultural sensitivity, and maintaining the site's aesthetic value.
- Heritage interpretation is proposed for the playground areas and includes opportunities for aboriginal cultural heritage elements.
- Preliminary *Statement of Heritage Impact* (SoHI) considerations were presented, and a low scale structure is proposed which aims to minimise environmental disruption and to maintain a visual connection with the surrounding landscape.
- A range of roof forms were considered and viewlines from various perspectives for the preferred design were presented.

Following the presentation, the Committee sought clarification on the engagement carried out to date with the community to consider the *Connecting with Country* and living culture of First Nations people

for the design of the site, and the visual analysis and how the topography and character of the place has influenced the design and materiality.

Members noted that:

- a more rigorous visual impact assessment will be completed as part of the final submission
- some initial consultation with the local Aboriginal community was conducted in the early masterplan stages which has been used to inform the Heritage interpretation in the play spaces and further community engagement is proposed for the coming months, and
- the *Yirran Muru Playspace* at Shoalhaven was cited as an exemplar for codesign.

The Committee thanked the council for the update and highlighted the issues of cumulative impact across the precinct, the importance of the critical nature of the community assets and the need for the design to carefully consider the heritage and character impacts to *Catherine Hill Bay* in the next phase of the project.

Resolution 2025-07
<p>The Heritage Council Approvals Committee:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>1. <b>Notes</b> the significant values of the site as listed on the State Heritage Register.</li><li>2. <b>Recognises</b> the important opportunity for this site, as a key community facility, to respond to its context, the historic landscape and exhibit design excellence.</li><li>3. <b>Provides</b> the following comments to Lake Macquarie City Council about the Community Hub at Middle Camp – Stage 1 of the Masterplan:<ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>a. The development proposal to adopt a first principle <i>Connecting with Country</i> design approach.</li><li>b. Undertake a rigorous site analysis that considers the evolution of the topography, landscape character, cultural context, views and vistas in order to inform the siting, form and scale of the various project elements.</li><li>c. The built form should respond to the site's setting, character and topography, minimising hard surfaces, integrating native plantings, and using sustainable water-sensitive design instead of traditional kerb and gutter systems.</li><li>d. Consider alternatives to reduce the visual impact of the Community Hub roof footprint on the landscape views.</li><li>e. Consider reorienting the café to improve access from the main carpark and reduce the building's bulk.</li><li>f. The Interpretation strategy needs to communicate the significance of the Catherine Hill Bay Cultural Precinct to the community including Aboriginal cultural heritage, the 'company town' development and its mining history.</li><li>g. Demonstrate the analysis and how the proposal responds to the various historic roof forms in the precinct.</li><li>h. Consider and aim to minimise the cumulative impact of this proposal within the context of the overall development of the precinct.</li></ol></li></ol>
Moved by Caitlin Allen and seconded by Julie Marler

## 2.2 14-16 Trinity Ave, Millers Point (SHR 00911) – section 60 pre lodgement consultation – residential alterations and additions

The Approvals Committee received a report from Heritage NSW and an applicant presentation on the proposed alterations and additions to *14–16 Trinity Avenue, Millers Point*, which are a pair of SHR listed Federation terrace houses.

### Key points noted

- Whilst the two dwellings are separately owned, a joint proposal with identical alterations and additions to both terraces has been developed as a unified approach.
- The proposal seeks to carefully insert an additional bedroom and its amenity at the rear of each property on top of the kitchen wing, with the design of the lightweight pavilion cradled by an extension of the original parapet.
- A visual impact analysis has been completed sightlines and mitigation measures were presented which aim to minimise the visual impacts including the use of transparent materials, a massing strategy that would maximise the setback from the side and rear boundaries of the property as well as soft plantings proposed to increase visual amenity and privacy for residents.
- Consultation with the architect and owners has occurred throughout the design process with the Conservation Management Plan (CMP) and associated policies setting the baseline for the heritage assessment.
- The significant fabric has been mapped and key heritage elements of the building such as the silhouette of the parapet and skillion form will be retained, and the proposed pavilion addition setback with an intentional clear distinction between the original heritage fabric and the new addition
- To minimise the impacts to the heritage fabric the additions are designed to be structurally independent from the terraces and utilise prefabricated components.
- Examples of other buildings where the built form has been amended in the *Millers Point and Dawes Point Precinct* were presented.

Following the presentation, the Committee sought clarification on:

- any conservation works proposed to the front of the terraces
- any consideration given to potential adaptation of the attic space
- the relationship with the buildings at the rear noting that more articulation is required to the design
- the additional built form and any potential structural impacts
- the need for fire separation at the upper levels with proposed mitigation through use of design and materiality to address fire and safety risks
- planting elements being considered
- whether the *Archaeological Zoning Plan* has been considered for this property, and
- how the *Millers Point Design Guidelines* have assisted in the design process.

*Elizabeth Owers joined the meeting at 10:40AM*

Members discussed the:

- topography of the site and the discreet intervention proposed by the design
- potential to lower the roof lantern
- overlay of the CMP, significance gradings, the design guidelines and heritage policies and any potential impacts the development may have on the character of the heritage precinct.

Resolution 2025-08
<p>The Heritage Council Approvals Committee:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>1. <b>Notes</b> the information provided in this summary paper.</li><li>2. <b>Notes</b> the information provided by the applicant with regard to the unique topographical nature of the site with the rear wing situated on a bedrock platform.</li><li>3. <b>Notes</b> that the proposal needs to consider the <i>Millers Point Guidelines</i> and provide justification as to why the proposal would be consistent with these guidelines.</li><li>4. <b>Provides</b> the following comments: The proposal will need to include more information on the following:</li></ol>

- a. The need for fire separation at the upper levels and the proposed mitigation through use of design and materiality to address fire and safety risks
- b. Structural impacts on the existing building to support the new floor including details and dimensions of proposed connection between the primary terraces and the service wings behind each of them and any other original structural detail
- c. Planting elements and the purpose of screening to be in keeping with the precinct's character
- d. Explore opportunities to reduce the impact of the lantern
- e. Demolition plan, the existing floor plan and sections
- f. Detailed schedule of conservation works for both properties
- g. A statement of heritage impact to address non-compliance with the endorsed *Conservation Management Plan* and the *Millers Point Guidelines*
- h. A visual analysis identifying significant views to and from the items including analysis of the impact of the proposed roof pavilion to the rear of each terrace
- i. Consideration of the *Millers Point Archaeological Zoning Plan* and any potential archaeological impact
- j. Impact of proposed services.

Moved by Alan Croker and seconded by Bruce Pettman

### 3.0 General Business

#### 3.1 Forward agenda

The Approvals Committee noted the forward agenda and discussed other out of session activities and correspondence.

*Kings Green concept DA site tour, 28 February 2025*

AC members David Burdon, Bruce Pettman and Alan Croker, provided their feedback following a site tour hosted by Merivale (proponent) to view *73-75 York Street* and other properties at George and Bridge Streets, Sydney which they attended together with Heritage NSW and the City of Sydney.

*Heritage NSW monthly reporting*

The Approvals Committee noted the Executive Director's report and the monthly Assessment Report and discussed the *Sunnyside Rail Bridge* partial collapse, which is being considered at the Heritage Council 5 March meeting.

Members discussed the broader considerations around public benefit when prioritising conservation works and potential opportunities for heritage interpretation, public access and activation.

### 4.0 Meeting Close

There being no further items of business, Nicholas Brunton, A/Chair, declared the Approvals Committee meeting closed at 12:30 PM.



Dr Nicholas Brunton

A/Chair, Heritage Council Approvals Committee

Date: 1 April 2025